Engaging the Private Sector

What matters most for engaging the private sector: the differences between policy intent and implementation

May 2014
Laura Lewis and Fred Brooker
Outline

• EPS implementation tools and processes

• Example: Timor-Leste
  – School Survey findings
  – Exercise
What policies are outlined?

**Encouraging innovation by providers**
- Allowing local decision making and fiscal decentralization
- Giving autonomy over managing resources, personnel, and educational content

**Holding Schools Accountable**
- Ensuring schools are accountable for outputs and outcomes
- Setting standards and conducting student assessments and school inspections
- Outlining sanctions and rewards for schools

**Empowering parents, students and communities**
- Ensuring parents are given information on school quality
- Supporting agency and voice
- Prohibiting selection of students based on academic ability or socioeconomic background

**Promoting diversity of supply**
- Encouraging market entry by different providers
- Guaranteeing funding (amount and timeliness) for government supported private schools

---

**Policy Goals**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy goals</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Development level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging innovation by providers</td>
<td></td>
<td>Established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holding schools accountable</td>
<td></td>
<td>Emerging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowering parents, students and the community</td>
<td></td>
<td>Established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting diversity of supply</td>
<td></td>
<td>Emerging</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Benchmarking**

- Encouraging innovation by providers
- Holding schools accountable
- Empowering parents, students and the community
- Promoting diversity of supply
Which of these policies are implemented?

- Does government require schools in your association to undergo an inspection?
- Does government require schools in your school to undergo an inspection?
- Does government require schools in a specific provider analysis for selection criteria of census locality to undergo an inspection?
- Does government require your school to undergo an inspection?

Private School Associations

- Asked to Chairperson of the largest 6-8 private school associations in the country
- Mean answer is then scored using the rubric, high levels of variability are also reported

School Providers

- Asked to Principal of 10% of schools in a specific census locality (see provider analysis for selection criteria of census locality)
- Mean answer

Government (Policy Intent)

- Based on documentation
- Policies, laws and other official documentation
- Does government require schools to undergo an inspection?

Data source

- Scoring
# Implementation Challenges - In Country X

## 1. Government policies not implemented

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Practice *% of schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Schools able to adapt curriculum to meet needs of students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>1/3 of teachers certified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School certification</td>
<td>All schools certified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standardized exams</td>
<td>All schools at a secondary level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School improvement plans</td>
<td>All schools submit plans as part of inspection process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2. Implementation steps not outlined explicitly in policy

**Limited requirements outline in policy-schools reported:**

- Playgrounds and outdoor space, dedicated classrooms (e.g., science labs), libraries
- School medical services (e.g., first aid center/sick bay),
- Land and building ownership
- Computers

## 3. Implementing policies which inhibit effective engagement

**Student selection based on academic ability**

- Public and private 71% and 80% schools respectively
- Favours more affluent

**Official policy no fees- schools reported:**

- Administration fee
- Ongoing certification fee
- Inspection fee
- Structural site inspection fee
What’s the level and quality of dialogue with the private sector?

### Policy Cycle

- **Agenda Setting**
- **Implementation**
- **Evaluation**

Outlines the extent to which policy dialogue happens throughout the policy cycle.

### Policy Goals

- **Encouraging innovation by providers**
- **Holding schools accountable**
- **Empowering parents, students and the community**
- **Promoting diversity of supply**

Outlines the extent to which policy dialogue happens to support each policy goal.

### Influence on Policy

- **National**
- **Regional**

Examines how well the private sector is organized the degree to which they've been able to influence the government.
Developing Effective Private Education in Nigeria (DEEPEN)

Overview
- 15,000 schools, 1.5 million students, Lagos, Nigeria
- DFID funded
- The programme will last for five years from September 2013 to August 2018
- £18 million

Wider Market Around Schools
- Regulation not financially supporting schools: rules, information, financing (non-direct - long lasting impact without the need for subsidization) and school improvement

Range of players
- Government, mass media, banks, school associations, research organizations and training providers
Who are the providers?

Mapping / Characteristics

Affordability

Case Studies of Innovations
Overview of Timor-Leste School Survey

The objective of the Timor-Leste 2012 Education Survey was to support the improvement of Timor-Leste’s education quality and service delivery through building a solid information source and analytical foundation.

There is a clear lack of comprehensive analysis, in particular of what is happening at the school-level. The purpose and scope of the Education Survey is complementary to the Education Management Information System (EMIS).

The 2012 survey obtained representative data on resources, policies and practices at the school level through face-to-face interviews at all 1,372 primary, pre-secondary and secondary schools of Timor-Leste.

The survey was undertaken for policy analysis. The survey results will facilitate evidence-based policy dialogue among development partners and the Timor-Leste government.
Private schools mainly serve at the secondary level

Distribution of schools by Level, 2012

- No gender differences between boys and girls attending private school
- Grade 4 Grade 8 higher enrollment of Girls in both public and private schools
Timor-Leste relies on multiple shift schools with no difference between public and private in terms of overcrowding.

- **% of schools operating more than one shift**
  - Dili: 70%
  - Timor-Leste Average: 60%

- **Share of schools with more than 60 students per classroom**
  - Public: 22%
  - Private: 20%

The data indicates that Timor-Leste relies heavily on multiple shift schools, with no significant difference in overcrowding between public and private schools.
Private schools have far more decision making autonomy at the school level for personnel.

% of School Directors who have decision making powers:

- Determining salary increases
- Establishing teachers salaries
- Selecting volunteer teachers
- Hiring teachers as contract
- Hiring teachers as permanent
- Firing contract teachers
- Firing permanent teachers
Private schools have far more decision making autonomy at the school level

% of School Directors who have decision making powers

- determining subjects
- determining instruction content
- choosing textbooks
- students repeat or promotion
- approving student admission
- establishing evaluation policies
- budget allocation
- formulating school budget

Public vs Private
Public schools have higher teacher and student absenteeism

**Teacher Absenteeism Grade 4**

- **Private**: 12%
- **Public**: 14%

**Student Absenteeism Grade 4**

- **Private**: 20%
- **Public**: 40%
Students can wait for over an hour at the beginning of the day.

A community member claimed that the teachers are almost always late because they are lazy. The teachers complain of the long distances from their homes to the school.
Private schools have a much higher reliance on volunteer teachers

% of Workforce

Private
Public
Female students in private schools less likely to repeat, similar repetition rates for boys in both types

% of Students no repetition in Grade 4

- Private
- Public

Male
Female
Private schools outperform public schools

Median number of Tetum Letters recognized by Grade 1 Students within one Minute

- Private
- Public
Exercise

• We are in the process of writing policy recommendations for Timor-Leste and need your help.

• There are a number of options open to Timor-Leste in order to reduce the prevalence of a double shift system in public schools. **For this exercise consider how could the private sector be engaged?**

• Select one type of private sector engagement: Government funded private schools, charters or vouchers.

• Please answer the following:
  • How should phasing and sequencing work? (timeframe)
  • How could you build trust and partnership between government and private sector?
  • How would you ensure the poor and marginalized are not excluded?
  • How will private providers be held accountable?

• You have 35 minutes, use your time wisely!!