Session 2.3
Overview of World Bank Support for Workforce Development

Jee-Peng Tan, Advisor and
Ryan Flynn, Consultant
Education Department
Human Development Network
The World Bank

April 15-16, 2013
Jakarta, Indonesia

Based on “Overview of World Bank Support for Workforce Development through Operations in Human Development during 2002-2012” by Manorama Gotur, Senior Operations Officer and Viviana Gomez, Consultant
Session Objective

- Present trends in World Bank support for WfD (2002-2012) under the Education and Social Protection Sector Boards

- Explore the composition of portfolio in relation to the SABER-WfD framework
1. Methodology and Sample

2. Project design and activities

3. Challenges and lessons
Methodology

- Project selection
- Create database of project features
- Analyze data
Methodology: Project selection

684
Universe of approved Education and Social Protection projects

476
Projects meeting search criteria

93
Total number of operations supporting Workforce Development in ED and SP

Keyword search

Review of PDOs and components

HDN - 1,063 projects
Health

SDN
3,116 Projects
(e.g. energy, agriculture, transport)

FPD
397 projects
(e.g. financial inclusion, competitive industries)

PREM
1,067 projects
(e.g. poverty reduction, gender)

ED

SP

Operations supporting WfD
Sample characteristics:
Number and distribution of projects supporting WfD

684 Education and Social Protection projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WfD</th>
<th>Other projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td>594</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

93 WfD projects, by sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ED</th>
<th>SP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

93 WfD projects, by funding source

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IBRD</th>
<th>IDA</th>
<th>BLEND</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

93 WfD projects, by region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AFR</th>
<th>LAC</th>
<th>ECA</th>
<th>SAR</th>
<th>MENA</th>
<th>EAP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13% of all ED and SP operations supported WfD

ED operations accounted for nearly two-thirds of the WfD operations

Both low- and middle-income countries received support for WfD

AFR and LAC accounted for the largest share of the WfD operations
Sample characteristics:
Volume of support for WfD ($ billion)

- $43.9 billion: Total investment in 684 ED and SP operations
- $8.9 billion: Investment in 93 ED and SP operations with WfD components
- $4.9 billion: Investment in WfD components within 93 ED and SP operations

Component breakdown:
- IBRD: 3.5
- IDA: 0.8
- BLEND: 0.6

$4.9 billion on WfD components in 93 ED and SP operations
Sample characteristics:
Distribution by Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>US $ Billion</th>
<th>Number of Projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFR</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCR</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECA</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAR</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAP</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sample characteristics:
Trends in the number of projects and volume of support for WfD

**Number of projects**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Projects</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Investment amount**

- **Jordan, Colombia, India**: $564 m
- **Argentina**: $350 m
- **Nigeria, India, Argentina**: $660 m
- **Poland**: $325 m
- **Mexico, Colombia**: $866 m
- **Morocco, Mexico**: $400 m
1. Methodology and Sample

2. Project design and activities

3. Challenges and lessons
Project development objectives (PDO)

- Effective Service Delivery: 19
- System Management: 36
- Quality: 47
- Access: 48
Project activities: *Access and Equity*

- **Increasing number of trainees**: 31
- **Financial support to trainees**: 34
- **Infrastructure improvement**: 13
- **Supporting the disadvantaged**: 30
Project activities: *Access and Equity (Example)*

**Liberia Youth Employment and Skills Project**

**PDO:** To expand access of poor and young Liberians to temporary employment programs and to improve youth employability

**Component 1:** Community works
- Scale up the ongoing Cash for Work Temporary Employment Project
- Technical assistance to the government to better coordinate and provide oversight for temporary employment activities.

**Component 2:** Skills for jobs
- Skills Development Programs
- TVET institutional development

**Indicators (examples):**
- Direct project beneficiaries / Female project beneficiaries
- Net income gain of targeted participants in year of participation
- Persons participating and completing skills development programs and receiving certification
Project activities:
*Quality and Relevance*

- Partnerships with industry: 17
- Curricula & program development: 34
- Teacher training: 20
- Student/teaching assessments: 7
Project activities: *Quality and Relevance (Example)*

**China Guangdong Technical and Vocational Education Training**

PDO: Increase quality and relevance of technical education in 3 pilot schools

**Component 1:**
School-based Reforms and Innovation

- Strengthen school-industry linkages
- Improve school management
- Reform Curriculum
- Improve student assessment and quality assurance
- Improve instructor quality
- Upgrade instructional equipment and facilities

**Component 2:**
Policy Development and Capacity Building

- Carry out policy research and knowledge sharing
- Improve monitoring and evaluation
- Enhance project management and coordination

**Indicators:**
- Percent of graduates who pass skill certification exams
- Percent of graduates finding initial employment within 6 months
- Starting salary of graduates (amount in US$)
Project activities:  
*System Management*

- Development of national policies: 30
- Identification of skill gaps: 7
- Incentives for firms to invest in training: 3
- Improving system governance: 18
- Capacity building of ministry/TVET authority: 33
- Developing financing framework: 4
- Skills qual. & accredit. systems: 21
- Diversifying pathways for skills acquisition: 8
Project activities: 
*Effective Service Delivery*

- Promoting diversity (non-state) in provision of training: 14
- Career development services: 18
- Increasing autonomy of training institutions: 14
- Labor market information systems: 29
1. Methodology and sample

2. Project design and activities

3. Challenges and lessons
ICR Ratings of Closed Projects supporting WfD

Number of closed projects: 32

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Moderately satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Protection</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## What results are being achieved?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>PDO</th>
<th>Results (preliminary in some cases)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **China** Guangdong Technical and Vocational Education Training | Relevance and quality            | Between 2010 and 2012:  
- % pass rates skills certification exams: 70% to 86%  
- % graduates finding employment in 3 months: 34% to 91%  
- Starting salary of graduates: $950 to $2,221                                                |
| **Mozambique** Technical and Vocational Education and Training | Relevance and quality            | Between 2006 and 2012:  
- Competency standards for 41 occupation levels approved  
- 32 new programs created  
- 1000+ students assessed through the new competency-based training regime                      |
| **Chile** Lifelong Learning and Training          | Employability                    | Between 2003 and 2010:  
- 40,000+ students enrolled in Technical Tertiary Institutions  
- 1,980 adults enrolled in job training programs  
- 12,000 SME workers received distance education & training                                       |
| **India** Vocational Training Improvement        | Employability                    | Between 2007-2012:  
- % graduates finding employment: 32% to 60%  
- Monthly earnings increased from $45 to $66                                                      |
| **Egypt** Skills Development                     | Demand-driven training           | Between 2004-2010:  
- 34,000+ employees from 1,155 private sector firms were trained upon individual firm’s training needs assessment  
- Training courses were competitively delivered through 106 training providers                   |
What went wrong?

Challenges faced by projects with unsatisfactory ICRs ratings
Thank You!

World Bank Team SABER-WfD:

Leader: Jee-Peng Tan (jtan@worldbank.org)

Members: Rita Costa, Angela Demas, Elise Egoume-Bossogo, Ryan Flynn, Viviana Gomez, Manorama Gotur, Kiong Hock Lee, Joy Nam, Marie Madeleine Ndaw, Brent Parton, and Alexandria Valerio