



System Approach for Better Education Results (SABER)

Workforce Development Implementation Guidelines

Background

1. Following the launch of the World Bank's Education Sector Strategy 2020, the Education Department (HDNED) of the World Bank's Human Development Network (HDN) has embarked on the System Approach for Better Education Results (SABER) Initiative to support implementation of the Strategy. The goal of the Initiative is to help countries systematically examine and strengthen the performance of their education and training systems and to evaluate the policy options for improvement. In line with this objective, the World Bank collaborates with other partners to develop diagnostic tools and leverage global knowledge to enhance the availability of policy data and understanding about what matters to achieve better outcomes in learning and skills development.

2. Workforce development (WfD) is one of the domains for which diagnostic tools are being developed and applied under the SABER Initiative.¹ It focuses on the systems, institutions and policies in place to promote the development of an appropriately-skilled workforce to support countries' economic and social development goals. SABER-WfD takes a systems view, collecting limited information on all aspects of a country's efforts in WfD to provide diagnostic information on the system as a whole. Thus, the areas covered include but are not necessarily limited to policies supporting pre-employment training, continuous education, active labor market programs and on-the-job training. As with other domains in the SABER Initiative, SABER-WfD seeks information on and input from a broad band of stakeholders whose participation and actions affect skills demand and supply and the match between them. These stakeholders (respondents) include government officials from at least two ministries, typically (though not exclusively) education and labor, with responsibility for oversight of training programs offered by public and private providers, as well as individuals, employers, researchers, industry groups and other users of skills.

3. A World Bank team developed a Data Collection Instrument (DCI) to collect data in a systematic and comparable manner across countries. A large number of experts from around the world were consulted through the development and piloting phases of the DCI to incorporate a wide range of perspectives and experiences. Since a key goal of the SABER-WfD is to provide information for analysis, benchmarking and comparison across countries, the World Bank team developed standard implementation protocols, as well as a training package for Principal Investigators (PI) and their research team to guide them through the implementation of the SABER-WfD project (training package available on July 15, 2012).

¹ Other domains include teacher policies, student assessment, governance, management, incentives, financing mechanisms, human resources, and quality assurance; see <http://go.worldbank.org/NK2EK7MKVO> for more information about the domains covered by the SABER-Initiative.

Overview of the SABER-WfD DCI and Expected Products

4. The DCI is a questionnaire organized around three functional dimensions of policies and institutions related to workforce development: strategy, oversight and service delivery. Within each of these functional dimensions, the questionnaire seeks information related to nine policy goals as shown in table 1. The data gathered by the questionnaire will be analyzed and scored according to pre-determined rubrics corresponding to four levels of maturity: latent, emerging, established and advanced.

Table 1: Functional Dimensions and Policy Goals in the SABER-WfD Framework

Functional Dimension	Policy Goal
Strategic Framework	1. Setting a Strategic Direction
	2. Fostering a Demand-Driven Approach
	3. Strengthening Critical Coordination
System Oversight	4. Ensuring Efficiency and Equity in Funding
	5. Assuring Relevant and Reliable Standards
	6. Diversifying Pathways for Skills Acquisition
Service Delivery	7. Promoting Diversity and Excellence in Training Provision
	8. Fostering Relevance in Public Training Programs
	9. Enhancing Accountability for Results

5. The information gathered using the SABER-WfD DCI will generate three products, as elaborated below.

6. Product 1: Completed Data Collection Instrument (DCI). Data should be collected using the latest version of the DCI (Version 2.5 dated August 15, 2012; available separately as an Excel file). The Excel file should be fully completed by answering all the questions on every worksheet. The final sheet of the workbook contains a list of the documents and sources consulted, including the informants and the basis of their credibility as informants. This documentary evidence base forms an integral part of the output from the data collection effort.

7. Product 2: SABER-WfD Country Report. The report will summarize the benchmarking results succinctly, following a standard format (template available separately). The report includes contextual information on the WfD system and detailed information on each of the nine SABER-WfD Policy Goals. A shorter Executive Summary, more suitable for sharing findings with some constituencies, will also be produced to distill key findings and messages.

8. Product 3: SABER-WfD Country Report presentation. The WfD Country Report and benchmarking scores are meant to help initiate and inform dialogue on a country’s WfD system among the World Bank, country counterparts and other key stakeholders within the country. Thus, at the discretion of the World Bank task team leader and country counterparts, events to facilitate dissemination and discussion of findings may be desirable. A presentation summarizing these findings is a key input into this process. In addition, the presentation may include information from other countries as a means to compare and contrast WfD policy actions and features across countries.

Team composition and the roles and responsibilities of its members

9. Consistent with a demand-led model for implementation, the work of producing the SABER-WfD Country Report will be initiated by the relevant World Bank task team leader with a request for support from the HDNED SABER-WfD Team. As the products outlined above will require team effort, it is useful to clarify the roles and responsibilities of the parties involved. Based on experience from the learning-by-doing approach followed in the first phase of the SABER-WfD, the involvement of the parties shown in Table 2 is appropriate. Note that for countries in which the World Bank does not have an operational relationship at present, the work will typically involve only the HDNED team and the Principal Investigator.

Table 2: Team Composition and Roles and Responsibility for SABER-WfD Tasks and Products

Type of Activity		World Bank Team		Principal Investigator (PI)	National Counterpart Team ^{a/}
		TTL for Country	HDNED		
Process	Expression of interest	Initiates	Responds	--	--
	Conduct of policy dialogue ^{b/}	Leads	Supports	Participates	Leads
	Contracting of PI and Other Resources ^{c/}	Leads	Supports	--	--
	Work-in-Progress Updates or Seminars	Participates	Supports	Leads	Participates
Products	Completed DCI	Provide inputs and comments	Supports	Leads	Provide inputs and comments
	Computerization of DCI data		Leads	Supports	
	Benchmarking results		Leads	Supports	
	SABER-WfD Country Report(s)		Supports	Leads	

a/ Relevant only in countries for which the World Bank has an active operational program.

b/ Led from the World Bank side by the task team leader (TTL) for the country concerned and on the government side by the relevant national counterpart team. Where no TTL exists for the country, the HDNED team will serve as the lead interlocutor.

c/ By necessity, the lead role will be played by the holder of the budget for the contracts.

10. The main roles and responsibilities of each of four main parties involved are as follows:

- **World Bank Task Team Leader (TTL).** Typically responsible for a World Bank operation or a piece of analytical work relating to skills development in the country concerned, this person could be mapped to either the education sector or the social protection sector. He or she leads (or co-leads) the Bank’s dialogue with the relevant government authorities regarding the SABER-WfD project in the

country, engages the government in forming the national counterpart team for this work and ensures its integration into the overall work program on skills for the country.

The TTL will be responsible for contracting the Principal Investigator (PI), who leads data collection and preparation of the SABER-WfD Country Report (see sample TORs for the PI in Annex 1 as well as the qualifications desired in a PI). He or she may seek support from the HDNED team to interview and select the PI. In addition, he or she will participate in the work-in-progress seminars, as time permits, and provide inputs, comments and guidance throughout the process of data collection and report preparation.

- **World Bank HDNED's SABER-WfD Team.** The HDNED Team will assign one of its senior members, supported by junior members and additional resource persons as appropriate, to support the work of the principal investigator, typically in the following ways: (a) gather secondary sources available at the World Bank; (b) assist with the start up of using the DCI; (c) provide inputs for completing the DCI; (d) arrange for and participate in work-in-progress seminars; (e) involve knowledgeable resource persons to provide critical oversight of the work; and (e) support the PI in the preparation of the SABER-WfD Country Reports. As needed, the World Bank TTL may request for additional support from the HDNED team (e.g., mission travel) to support the work of the PI.

The team is responsible for creating and updating the DCI and the related software for data processing. The principal investigator will therefore send the completed DCI to the team so that the data can be processed to generate the benchmarking results for the country concerned. These results will be shared with the TTL and the principal investigator who will in turn use them to prepare the Country Report. They will also be incorporated into a database maintained by HDNED.

- **Principal Investigator (PI) and research team².** This person will play the lead role in collecting the data required by the DCI and for preparing the Country Report. This report will be based on the benchmarking results to be generated by the HDNED SABER-WfD team using the completed DCI. The PI and research team is expected to collaborate closely with the HDNED SABER-WfD team in matters relating to the application of the DCI, the collection of data and interpretation of the questions in the DCI, and the computerization and processing of the data collected by this tool. Given that some of the data to be collected will require interviews with credible informants, the PI will need to be effective as an interviewer of such persons. In addition, this person should be someone who is knowledgeable about WfD issues in all its dimensions and therefore able to exercise good judgment in extracting information relevant information for the DCI from documentary evidence.

- **National Counterpart Team.** The purpose of this team is to engage with the World Bank team led by the relevant TTL on the preparation of the Country Report. At the early stages of the work, the team will provide guidance on data collection while at a later stage, it will provide inputs and feedback to inform the drafting of the Country Report and take the lead in discussing the Report's implications for next steps for policy development with regard to skills development in the country.

Steps for data collection using the DCI

11. Because the quality of the data collected is critical for the reliability of the benchmarking exercise, it is important to explain the processes envisaged for quality assurance. Following these steps will also foster the application of standard protocols across countries to enhance the comparability of results from the benchmarking exercise. The nature of the desired data is such as to require, typically,

² At the discretion of the TTL and PI, the PI may be supported by a research team comprised of one or two junior consultants who would assist with the identification, assembly and review of documentary evidence.

an iterative process for completing the DCI, mainly involving the PI and the TTL and HDNED team. Members of the national team should also engage at critical junctures in the process.

12. For the PI, ten main steps are involved, as follows:

- **Step 1: participate in orientation session to review the** objective and implementation roadmap of the SABER-WfD project and obtain a set of reference materials and implementation documents;
- **Step 2: participate in a training session** (3 hours) to learn about the content and administration of the DCI, as well as the preparation of the country report;
- **Step 3: submit implementation work plan** to describe intended implementation plan, team and timeline;
- **Step 4: carry out documentary evidence review** based on the secondary sources;
- **Step 5: carry out interviews with credible informants (individual, focus groups, etc.)** to fill in the gaps, corroborate and triangulate information gathered through the review of documentary evidence;
- **Step 6: submit completed DCI** to the HDNED team to allow for information to be scored following established scoring criteria and decision rules;
- **Step 7: prepare summary PPT** to communicate findings, crystallize key messages and present preliminary scores (HDNED team will provide template)
- **Step 8: validate information** through workshop(s) with a small group of knowledgeable and influential thinkers and stakeholders to ensure the answers selected in the DCI are accurate;
- **Step 9: prepare Country Report** to summarize findings, using as inputs (a) the scores to be prepared by the HDNED team, (b) the SABER-WfD rubrics used to associate the scores with a specific level of system development and, (c) information gathered through the documentary and personal interviews.
- **Step 10: take part in dissemination** events at the discretion of the World Bank task team leader and country counterparts.

13. The TTL and HDNED team will be the PI's main counterpart in working through the foregoing steps. They will schedule periodic work-in-progress seminars throughout the process.

Steps for benchmarking and for preparing the Country Report

14. The completed DCI will be submitted to the HDNED team who will carry out a data consistency check and score the information using a software program. The software will generate the benchmarking results which will then be used by the PI to prepare the Country Report.

15. The Country Report will focus mainly on the data collected using the DCI. For completeness, it will also contain contextual information about the country's WfD system and economic, political and demographic environment in which the system operates.

16. For most countries, data will be collected for the most recent year possible. For some countries where WfD has evolved rapidly with interesting results or that which to examine the evolution of policies and institutions over time, data may be collected for several years in the past few decades.

17. Following standard practice at the World Bank, peer reviewers will be invited to provide feedback on the Report as part of the quality assurance arrangements. The SABER-WfD Team, in consultation with the relevant TTL, will organize a formal review meeting during which peer reviewers can share their comments on the Country Report. Following this meeting, the PI will revise the report as needed. The TTL will use the completed report as appropriate in policy dialogue with the government.

Timeframe for Implementation

18. The SABER-WfD process takes approximately 24 weeks (full time) from initiation to completion of the Country Report.³ The majority of this time is spent on data collection and verification, reflecting the importance of these steps to the quality and reliability of the benchmarking results. Data collection and scoring is an iterative process requiring that the PI both involve knowledgeable informants and stakeholders in data verification and work with the TTL and HDNED team to ensure data are in a format that can be processed and scored. To facilitate these two activities, a series of work-in-progress seminars should be held. Table 3 below provides an overview of the time needed for completion of each step and the suggested timing and frequency of work-in-progress seminars.

Table 3: Suggested Timeline for Completion of Steps in SABER-WfD Process

	Weeks																							
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24
Step 1	█																							
Step 2		█																						
Step 3		█	█																					
Step 4			█	█	█	█	○	█	█															
Step 5								█	█	█	█	█	█	█	█	○								
Step 6																█	█							
Step 7																		█	█	○				
Step 8																			█	█				
Step 9																			█	█	○	█	█	█
Step 10																								

○ Suggested work-in-progress seminars with HDNED and TTL

³ The implementation timeline may vary depending on several factors including: availability of documents, size of the research team, number of time periods under review, size of the country, etc.

Dissemination x1of Products

19. The completed DCI, along with the supporting evidence, will form part of the SABER-WfD database maintained by HDNED Team. The World Bank TTL will discuss with the relevant national counterparts the next steps for disseminating the benchmarking results and the Country Report. The HDNED Team will be available to provide continued support as desired.

Annex 1

SABER-WfD | Principal Investigator Terms of Reference and Qualifications

(Template to be contextualized by TTLs)

1. Background

Following the recent launch of the World Bank's Education Sector Strategy 2020, the Education Department (HDNED) of the World Bank's Human Development Network (HDN) has embarked on the System Approach for Better Education Results (SABER) Initiative to support implementation of the Strategy. The goal of the Initiative is to help countries systematically examine and strengthen the performance of their education and training systems and to evaluate the policy options for improvement.

Workforce Development (WfD) is one of the domains for which diagnostic tools are being developed and applied under the SABER Initiative. As with other domains in the Initiative, SABER-WfD takes a systems approach by considering a broad band of stakeholders whose participation and actions affect skills demand and supply and the match between them. These stakeholders include government officials from at least two ministries, typically (though not exclusively) education and labor, with responsibility for oversight of training programs offered by public and private providers, as well as individuals, employers, industry groups and other users of skills

The World Bank SABER-WfD team developed a Data Collection Instrument (DCI) to collect data in a systematic and comparable manner across countries. An important goal of SABER-WfD is to apply this diagnostic tool in a range of countries to collect information on institutions and policies for workforce development. Country specific Information will be collected using standardized methodologies, tools and implementation protocols. Data and findings from the project will be placed in an international database that will serve as a resource for countries to compare their performance with that of other countries and identify actionable options for improvement. A Principal Investigator (PI) will be contracted to lead the data collection process in participating countries. The PI will work under the leadership of the TTL in [INSERT COUNTRY NAME] and would be expected to collaborate closely with World Bank team members and a national counterpart team.

The following constitutes a Terms of Reference (TOR) for the consultancy, covering the period from [INSERT DATE] to [INSERT DATE].

2. Responsibilities and Outputs

The consultant will be responsible for assembling reference materials, leading the data collection effort and preparing the WfD country report. The consultant's specific outputs are as follows:

Products

□ **Catalogue of references, list of credible informants and implementation workplan.** The consultant will provide a short report with a list of the references materials and initial list of credible informants to be interviewed for the project. A short report outlining the implementation roadmap, with proposed milestones for the products and processes indicated below, will also be prepared and

submitted to the World Bank team for feedback. The catalogue and report should be available two weeks after signing the contract.

- **Progress reports, typically in the form of partially completed DCI (Excel file).** The consultant will submit a partially filled out DCI using the secondary sources and information from interviews with the initial list of credible informants. The incomplete DCI will provide a basis for the work-in-progress seminars and help identify information gaps that may require additional interviews with credible informants or review of new references. The first draft of the DCI should be available two to three weeks after receiving feedback on the catalogue of references and implementation roadmap. Subsequent submissions should follow a schedule agreed between the PI and the relevant TTL and HDNED Bank team.
- **Completed DCI (Excel file).** The consultant will submit a completed DCI in English, based on secondary sources and interviews with credible informants to the SABER-WfD team for data processing. The consultant should be available to answer questions from the SABER-WfD team as the data are processed. The completed DCI should be available no later than 4 months from the signing of the contract.
- **WfD Country Report.** The consultant will prepare a report in English using the benchmarking results that will be provided by the SABER-WfD team. The report will follow a standard template and incorporate contextual information about the country's system of workforce development, and brief commentary of a set of standard indicators relevant to the topic. As appropriate, the PI may modify the report to take into account country-specific conditions and requirements. The report should be available three to four weeks after receiving the benchmarking results and other relevant inputs from the SABER-WfD team and will be subject to formal World Bank review before publication.

Technical Meetings

- **Data validation.** The consultant will be expected to carry out a process of validation to: (a) ensure that the answers chosen in the DCI reflect information that is as accurate and complete as possible; and (b) generate and follow up on additional leads to documents or informants. The process will typically involve work-in-progress seminars and may also include stand-alone in-country meetings with national counterparts. If the latter is selected, the consultant will be expected to record feedback from the meetings and share written feedback as part of the work-in-progress seminars with the World Bank task team.
- **Work-in-progress seminars.** The consultant will participate in these seminars to: (a) share preliminary results and the progress of the data collection effort; and (b) obtain guidance and suggestions on documents and informants to add to the evidence base in order to fill the data gaps and to strengthen the accuracy and credibility of the information gathered. These seminars may range from informal consultations to more formal review meetings, typically with knowledgeable observers of the country in question and the involvement of the World Bank SABER-WfD Team. As appropriate and desired, WiPS may be organized separately for each of the three Dimensions in the DCI (e.g., in order to keep the meetings to a reasonable duration).

3. Qualifications

The consultant will be selected based on the following criteria:

- Master's degree with a minimum of fifteen years of relevant experience in workforce development analysis and planning and education and training policy design and evaluation, or equivalent combination of education and experience;

- Solid knowledge of, or research experience pertaining to, training-related issues;
- A excellent track record of being proactive, working effectively, delivering results and being a key member of task teams to accomplish tasks both large and small with little oversight and guidance; and
- Excellent organizational and team skills, measured by:
 - Superb attention to details, and demonstrated sound organizational skills;
 - Ability to prioritize effectively and work with minimal supervision;
 - Ability to deliver assignments in a timely manner while operating under tight deadlines and juggling multiple tasks;
 - Strong interpersonal skills and ability to work effectively in teams;
 - Contacts and experience working with a range of stakeholders, particularly training stakeholders, on facilitating multi-stakeholder coalition building at the country level; and
 - Proficiency in English and [INSERT LANGUAGE]

4. Reporting

The consultant will report to [insert name, title and unit].

5. Terms of Contract and Period of Work

The consultant will be contracted for a period of [INSERT NUMBER] days from [INSERT DATES].

6. Charge code: XXXXXX

Draft [INSERT DATE]

SABER-WfD | Research Analyst

Terms of Reference and Qualifications

(Template to be contextualized by TTLs)

1. Background

Following the recent launch of the World Bank's Education Sector Strategy 2020, the Education Department (HDNED) of the World Bank's Human Development Network (HDN) has embarked on the System Approach for Better Education Results (SABER) Initiative to support implementation of the Strategy. The goal of the Initiative is to help countries systematically examine and strengthen the performance of their education and training systems and to evaluate the policy options for improvement.

Workforce Development (WfD) is one of the domains for which diagnostic tools are being developed and applied under the SABER Initiative. As with other domains in the Initiative, SABER-WfD takes a systems approach by considering a broad band of stakeholders whose participation and actions affect skills demand and supply and the match between them. These stakeholders include government officials from at least two ministries, typically (though not exclusively) education and labor, with responsibility for oversight of training programs offered by public and private providers, as well as individuals, employers, industry groups and other users of skills

The World Bank SABER-WfD team developed a Data Collection Instrument (DCI) to collect data in a systematic and comparable manner across countries. An important goal of SABER-WfD is to apply this diagnostic tool in a range of countries to collect information on institutions and policies for workforce development. Country specific Information will be collected using standardized methodologies, tools and implementation protocols. Data and findings from the project will be placed in an international database that will serve as a resource for countries to compare their performance with that of other countries and identify actionable options for improvement. A Principal Investigator (PI) will be contracted to lead the data collection process in participating countries. The PI will work under the leadership of the TTL in [INSERT COUNTRY NAME]] and would be expected to collaborate closely with World Bank team members and a national counterpart team.

The following constitutes a Terms of Reference (TOR) for the consultancy, covering the period from [INSERT DATE] to [INSERT DATE].

2. Responsibilities and Outputs

The consultant will be responsible for working with the Principal Investigator (PI) to assemble reference materials, carry out the data collection effort and prepare the WfD country report. The consultant's specific outputs are as follows:

Products

□ **Catalogue of references, list of credible informants and implementation workplan.** The consultant will provide a short report with a list of the references, materials and initial list of credible informants to be interviewed for the project. A short report outlining the implementation roadmap, with proposed milestones for the products and processed indicated below, will also be prepared and submitted to the World Bank team for feedback. The catalogue and report should be available two weeks after signing the contract.

- **Progress reports, typically in the form of partially completed DCI (Excel file).** The consultant will submit a partially filled out DCI using the secondary sources and information from interviews with the initial list of credible informants. The incomplete DCI will provide a basis for the work-in-progress seminars and help identify information gaps that may require additional interviews with credible informants or review of new references. The first draft of the DCI should be available two to three weeks after receiving feedback on the catalogue of references and implementation roadmap. Subsequent submissions should follow a schedule agreed between the PI and the relevant TTL and HDNED Bank team.
- **Completed DCI (Excel file).** The consultant will submit a completed DCI in English, based on secondary sources and interviews with credible informants to the SABER-WfD team for data processing. The consultant should be available to answer questions from the SABER-WfD team as the data are processed. The completed DCI should be available no later than 4 months from the signing of the contract.
- **WfD Country Report.** The consultant will prepare a report in English using the benchmarking results that will be provided by the SABER-WfD team. The report will follow a standard template and incorporate contextual information about the country's system of workforce development, and brief commentary of a set of standard indicators relevant to the topic. As appropriate, the PI may modify the report to take into account country-specific conditions and requirements. The report should be available three to four weeks after receiving the benchmarking results and other relevant inputs from the SABER-WfD team and will be subject to formal World Bank review before publication.

Technical Meetings

- **Data validation.** The consultant will be expected to carry out a process of validation to: (a) ensure that the answers chosen in the DCI reflect information that is as accurate and complete as possible; and (b) generate and follow up on additional leads to documents or informants. The process will typically involve work-in-progress seminars and may also include stand-alone in-country meetings with national counterparts. If the latter is selected, the consultant will be expected to record feedback from the meetings and share written feedback as part of the work-in-progress seminars with the World Bank task team.
- **Work-in-progress seminars.** The consultant will participate in these seminars to: (a) share preliminary results and the progress of the data collection effort; and (b) obtain guidance and suggestions on documents and informants to add to the evidence base in order to fill the data gaps and to strengthen the accuracy and credibility of the information gathered. These seminars may range from informal consultations to more formal review meetings, typically with knowledgeable observers of the country in question and the involvement of the World Bank SABER-WfD Team. As appropriate and desired, WiPS may be organized separately for each of the three Dimensions in the DCI (e.g., in order to keep the meetings to a reasonable duration).

3. Qualifications

The consultant will be selected based on the following criteria:

- Bachelor's/Master's degree with a minimum of five years of relevant experience in workforce development analysis and planning and education and training policy design and evaluation, or equivalent combination of education and experience;
- Research and practical experience pertaining to training-related issues;

- A excellent track record of being proactive, working effectively, delivering results and being a key member of task teams to accomplish tasks both large and small with little oversight and guidance; and
- Excellent organizational and team skills, measured by:
 - Superb attention to details, and demonstrated sound organizational skills;
 - Ability to prioritize effectively and work with minimal supervision;
 - Ability to deliver assignments in a timely manner while operating under tight deadlines and juggling multiple tasks;
 - Strong interpersonal skills and ability to work effectively in teams;
 - Contacts and experience working with a range of stakeholders, particularly training stakeholders, on facilitating multi-stakeholder coalition building at the country level; and
 - Proficiency in English and [INSERT LANGUAGE]

4. Reporting

The consultant will report to [insert name, title and unit].

5. Terms of Contract and Period of Work

The consultant will be contracted for a period of [INSERT NUMBER] days from [INSERT DATES].

6. Charge code: XXXXXX

Draft [INSERT DATE]