CONDITIONAL CASH TRANSFERS & DISABILITY INTEGRATION

Case Studies of Afghanistan, Greece and Macedonia

Team Members

Ahmad S. Shahriar  
SPLGP, World Bank  
Afghanistan

George Planiteros & Myropi Komninou  
Ministry of Labor, Social Insurance & Welfare, Greece

Jasmine Jovanovska  
Ministry of Labor & Social Policy  
Macedonia

Jasmine Ivanova  
Ministry of Labor & Social Policy  
Macedonia

December 18th, 2014
General Facts on SSN Systems and Disability Integration

- Disability; a cross-cutting issue; more/less 15% of world population
- Many countries not putting this agenda as a priority area
- Females with disability more vulnerable to gender based violence compared to other disabled groups
- Among the poorest quintiles of population, lower income, unemployed, lower educational qualifications and less access to labor markets, and etc.
- Inclusion of people with disability mostly less focused but more expensive
Economic growth down sharply from average of 9.4 percent per year during 2003-2012 to 3.7 percent in 2013, has slowed further to 1.5 percent in 2014.

A deteriorating fiscal crisis is underway, with declining revenues leading to an unfinanced fiscal gap, depleted cash reserves, and accumulating arrears, with no budget to pay for the salary of civil servants for the month of January.

Disability rate vary from 400,000 (NRVA-2007/2008) - 800,000 (Handicap International, 2005).

Almost 14% of rural households have a disabled family member while majority of them are poor.

Using national poverty line of Afs1,255 per person per month, 36% of the population is poor, with poverty rate rising to around 45% during the winter season (November – March).
Cash Transfers & Disability Integration in Afghanistan

- Covering families of martyrs and those with disabilities as a result of land mine and war
- 200,000 families receive a monthly benefit of up to $13/month, paid quarterly
- Largest national cash transfer program (0.2 percent of GDP)
- Eligibility process involves verification by the local community, government office, and a special health commission
- Program management is archaic and structured around manual paper based processes which makes monitoring and budgeting extremely difficult
Ongoing SSN Reforms in Afghanistan

- Developing a disabled registration system with standard notifications
- Distribution of cards and opening bank accounts for beneficiaries
- Proper certification process in order to deal with ghost payments, etc.
- Building a sustainable system to get rid of paper based system
- Reduced fragmentation and duplication
- Training of the host ministry staff on disability payments
- Refurbishing the offices and putting ramps and other considerations of the beneficiaries in the offices
SSN Challenges in Afghanistan

- **Sustainability**
  - Financial/budgetary issues (many competing sectors)
  - Capacity for implementation of projects and infrastructure

- **Security**
  - Poorer provinces are more likely to be insecure

- Absence of a comprehensive and reliable socio-economic data (difficult to make a policy decision)
- Targeting and data collection challenges (Exclusion/Inclusion errors)
- Delivery of payment in a regular, transparent and secure way
Main characteristics of Social Protection System - Greece

- High degree of fragmentation
- Inadequacy, lack of uniformity and inefficiency in the benefits provided
- Absence of co-ordination between individual services, centralized administrative and operating structures and disparities in coverage

Note: Informal care is widely practiced through the family
Structure of the Program

1. Income Support
2. Providing Social Services & Goods
3. Work Integration & Reintegration
Work Integration and Reintegration: Conditionality of the GSI

- New jobs - cover the proposed position in the private sector; otherwise expelled from the program
- Community service programs
- Internships and work experience
- Integration or reintegration into the education system
- Counseling, training and promotion at work

Excludes: Non-active population and those not able to work
Disability in the GSI

- The eligibility criteria are not differentiated in terms of disability, although welfare disability benefits provided by the state are not counted as income.
- Conditionality is valid (if beneficiary is able to work)

**Key note:** studies have shown that disabled people need more income in order to avail themselves of the same opportunities and living standards as non-disabled people.
Challenges-Greece

- The Social Protection System reform and the strategic planning of a comprehensive Social Protection System
- The national roll out of the Minimum Guaranteed Income Program

Social Welfare in Transition
Different Approaches

How to deal with conditionality to allow people with disabilities to participate?

- Provide additional specified assistance to disabled people to help them comply with GSI requirements
- Coordination of GSI with policies to make service delivery more inclusive
- Exempt disabled people from conditionalities
SSN Related Economic Statistics – Macedonia

- Economic growth = 4.1% (third semester, 2014)
- Disability rate 10% (of whole population 2,022,547)
- Unemployment rate = 27.9 (third semester, 2014)
- Employment rate = 41.3%
In case of Macedonia, there is no conditional cash transfer for people with disability, however, there is an unconditional cash transfer specifically targeting children with disability.

The Government’s Conditional Cash Transfer Education Grant Program is being implemented for a fifth consecutive year by the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy and it is intended for secondary school students who belong to social financial assistance households (SFA) as an additional financial assistance for regularly attending school. In this manner, the Government invests in human capital and facilitates their later transfer to the labor market.